March 2, 2015

Dr. Brice W. Harris
Chancellor
California Community Colleges
1102 Q Street, Suite 4554
Sacramento, California 95811

Dear Brice:

The California State University’s discipline faculty, academic senate and academic leadership across the 23 campuses, as well as in the Chancellor’s Office, mobilized on short order to review the fifteen baccalaureate degree pilot proposals from the California Community Colleges.

I commend the positive working relationship among the CSU and CCC faculty and administration that has long served and continues to serve California. The approach taken by the CSU was to analyze duplication in keeping with the California Education Code Section 78042(d) authorization of CCC baccalaureate degrees:

1. A district shall identify and document unmet workforce needs in the subject area of the baccalaureate degree to be offered and offer a baccalaureate degree at a campus in a subject area with unmet workforce needs in the local community or region of the district.

2. A baccalaureate degree pilot program shall not offer a baccalaureate degree program or program curricula already offered by the California State University or the University of California.

As summarized in Appendix A, we raise no objections with nine proposed programs, find four proposed programs need improvement to mitigate duplication, and object to two programs. With respect to the four proposals needing more work, we make recommendations to mitigate these concerns and are encouraged that Senate Bill 850 contemplates it may take time for program refinement to avoid duplication, by indicating pilot programs are to start no later than 2017-18.

The depth and breadth of information across proposals varied. Thus, the analysis of selected proposals was complicated by several factors, including incomplete information, lack of course descriptions, and lack of Classification of Instructional Programs (CIP) codes or use of CIP codes inconsistent with the curriculum.
As you know, the CIP codes and their corresponding definitions establish a national understanding of the content of degree and certificate programs with specific titles. CIP codes are used for federal reporting of enrollments and degrees conferred. CSU programs must conform to this system; however, the proposed CCC programs often had no listing in the CIP tables. We discovered that CCC proposed program title that differed from that in the CSU could be mistakenly interpreted to mean the program was not duplicative. However, analysis of underlying information, when available in sufficient detail, indicated a range of duplication across some of the proposals.

Again, I appreciate the consultation on these important matters that can better serve California and more importantly appreciate the continued positive working relationship among the faculty, staff and leadership across the CSU and CCC. As the CCC moves forward on these programs, CSU faculty and staff stand ready to provide further level of detail to any concerns noted.

Sincerely,

Timothy P. White
Chancellor
Appendix A. CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY REVIEW OF CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGE BACCALAUREATE DEGREE PILOT PROPOSALS

The CSU has no objection to nine proposed baccalaureate degree pilot programs at the CCC campuses indicated as we find substantive differences from CSU programs:

- Dental Hygiene, Foothill
- Dental Hygiene, West Los Angeles
- Mortuary Science, Cypress College
- Airframe Manufacturing Technology, Antelope Valley College
- Equine Industry, Feather River College
- Health Information Management, Shasta College
- Health Information Management, San Diego Mesa College
- Industrial Automation, Bakersfield College
- Respiratory Therapy, Skyline College

The CSU is concerned with four proposed baccalaureate degree pilot programs at the CCC campuses indicated, as the duplication with CSU programs is significant. However, we are ready to work with your districts to modify the proposed pilot programs to make them work for both of us:

- Emergency Services and Allied Health Systems, Crafton Hills College

  Duplication of upper-division Health Sciences and Health Care Administration with CSU programs including those at Cal Poly Pomona and CSU Domínguez Hills. We recommend the CCC faculty build an upper division more closely coherent to emergency services, rather than the current broader preparation expressed as “prepare individuals to fill existing and emerging needs in the health care system that require complex problems and systems.”

- Occupational Studies, Santa Ana College

  Proposal overlaps the Kinesiology major at Cal Poly Pomona, and the career objectives for Occupational Studies graduates would be similar to Kinesiology major across the system, many of whom are qualified to work as OT aides upon graduation. We recommend the proposal be developed further and in consultation with CSU faculty.

- Biomanufacturing, Mira Costa College

  More overlap of courses than outright duplication of program, including at CSU San Marcos, and to a lesser extent with Fullerton. We recommend the proposal be developed further and in consultation with CSU faculty.
• Respiratory Care, Modesto Junior College

This proposal is not yet well enough developed to properly analyze, but appears to duplicate content and learning objectives of similar programs at Stanislaus. We recommend the proposal be developed further and in consultation with CSU faculty.

The CSU objects to two baccalaureate program proposals that exceed the intent of Senate Bill 850 regarding duplication:

• Interaction Design, Santa Monica College

This program duplicates CSU’s multimedia/graphic design baccalaureate content. The CSU multimedia and graphic design programs were established when the conventional term for the study of interactive media design was “Multimedia,” and when the title “Interaction Design” was rarely used. The proposal states that a search of the national Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS) indicated that no public university offered a program in interaction design (p.8). That is because there is no such program title in the national database, which uses IPEDS’ CIP codes to track program enrollments and degrees awarded.

The 2 + 2 design duplicates CSU lower division of bachelor’s programs by building on Graphic Design associate’s. The proposal states the program, “builds upon and complements SMC’s existing Graphic Design Associate degree and certificates.” That is the equivalent of the CSU’s lower-division design programs at 12 campuses, including CSU Los Angeles, CSU Long Beach, Cal Poly Pomona, CSU San Bernardino, and others. The planned baccalaureate program therefore represents a duplication at the lower division, of 12 CSU degree programs, at the least.

The content duplicates design offerings at CSU campuses. The proposal states that the specific focus on user experience (UX) and interaction design (IxD) set this program apart from others offered at public universities. However, Cal Poly Pomona points out that duplication will necessarily result from meeting National Association of Schools of Art and Design (NASAD) accreditation requirements for these bachelor’s programs. The Pomona BFA in Graphics Design program includes UX and IxD, among the many required core courses, for example, and the CSU Long Beach BA in Design and the BFA in Graphic Design both include extensive coverage of interaction design. CSU East Bay details that the SMC proposed Interaction Design BA and the CSU East Bay Multimedia BA have an overlap of 75-90%. CSU Fullerton reports that their design and engineering degrees and internship programs work directly with local agencies to provide students with the links needed between their academic studies and potential career paths in the interaction design fields, thereby meeting regional workforce needs in these fields. CSU Monterey Bay Computing and Design program links interaction design and technical components, most completely in the Interactive Media and Game Design Emphasis. San Jose State
University teaches interactive design as an integral part of its Graphic Design and Industrial Design degrees, which includes courses in “User Interface and Interaction Design,” “Interactive and Interface Design,” and “Ergonomics for Design.”

- Automotive Technology, Rio Honda College

This program duplicates the CSU upper-division business management content. The program is designed as a “2 + 2” package degree program (p.1) for students with various associate’s degrees and allows students to complete the program with either a technical focus or “Automotive Management and Marketing (Entrepreneurship)” focus with courses in: management, organizational theory and behavior, legal and social environment of business, business and managerial finances, sales and marketing strategies and techniques, and directed study (p.8). These are generic business courses and are neither tied in a coherent way to an automotive technology lower division, nor do they require that preparation.

The automotive technical track duplicates the Cal State LA industrial technology program and automotive curricula and career preparation. The CSU Los Angeles program prepares graduates for “technical leadership” in industries including transportation. Rio Hondo proposed objectives include: “to graduate students who are ready for employment in the rapidly-evolving automotive/transportation field in technical, management, and professional occupations” (p.1). Representative CSU Los Angeles courses include: TECH 100 - Introduction to Automotive Mechanisms; TECH 488 – Fluid Power (3); TECH 370 – Power, Energy and Transportation; TECH 405 - Engine Design and Performance; ECH 470 - Electric, Hybrid and Alternative Fueled Vehicles; TECH 474 - Power Generation, Distribution and Utilization; and TECH 476 - Electronic and Computer Control Systems for Power, Energy and Transportation.

The 2 + 2 design duplicates CSU lower-division of bachelor’s programs by accepting associate’s degrees in many CSU disciplines in satisfaction of the automotive technology program’s required lower division. The proposal says the program “will target graduates” from associate’s programs (“or equivalent”) in “business administration, communications studies,” and “industrial technology” (all offered at Cal State Los Angeles and other CSU campuses), plus “engineering technology” (offered at Cal Poly Pomona), or various technology-related degree programs.